



# A comparative study of dialogue in common anecdotes of Shaikh Attar Neishabouri's works and Molana Jalal-al-Din's Masnavi (first, second, and third books)

Saeid Akbari Pabandi<sup>1</sup>, Mina Mahdikhani<sup>2</sup>, Robab Afshari<sup>3</sup>, Nasrin Mahdikhani<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Master in Persian Language and Literature, Technical and Vocational University, Al-Ghadir Zanzan branch, Zanzan, Iran.

<sup>2</sup>PhD Candidate, General linguistics, Female Teacher Training University, Isfahan, Iran.

<sup>3</sup>Master in Persian Language and Literature, Zanzan, Iran.

<sup>4</sup>Master in Persian Language and Literature, Zanzan, Iran

*Abstract: In comparing Molana Jalal-al-Din's Masnavi and the available works of Shaikh Attar Neishabouri, there are significant common points which are the result of undue influence of Attar on ideas and works of Molana. In this regard, it can be said that a great part of Molana's mystical genius and masterpiece is developed thanks to his teacher, Attar. The approaches that he uses in fiction stories is associated with statement of transcendental concepts and means in context of dialogue; so, there are always proposed new subsidiary stories in the dialogue of characters without disrupting the continuity of main body of story. With the morphology and classification of forty-two stories' dialogues, a comprehensive and systematic review is obtained. This review helps to get quickly more familiar with this valuable works and their structure and content.*

**Keywords:** Attar, Molana, Comparison, Dialogue, Anecdote.

## INTRODUCTION

The role of dialogue is crucial in common works of Molana Jalal-al-Din and Sheikh Attar Neishabouri, because the dialogue is not only a part of story, it but also is a director of other parts of story such as structure, theme, characterization, scene creation, exemplification, and etc.

It is important to note that despite all exemplary consistency and conformity in studied stories, the Masnavi's characters dialogue is different from other literature, including the Attar's works and has unique dynamism and diversity. The Masnavi's dialogue range is very wide and includes from elements and actions of this world, animals, trees, and objects to other world, angels, devil, metaphysics, dreams, and etc.; all of these play their roles in the context of dialogue.

A) Structure of dialogue in Attar's anecdotes:

1- The master and footboy have a dialogue on bringing oil carboy by footboy (Asrarname, couplets 1612-1615)

B) Structure of dialogue in Molana's anecdotes:

1- Here is also a dialogue between master and footboy on bringing carboy oil by footboy (Masnavi, first book, couplets 328-331)

The master and footboy are dialogue parts in both anecdotes. The squint eye of footboy is the topic of both anecdotes.

Examining both anecdotes, it is found that the dialogue occurs only two times in Attar's anecdotes and it includes mostly the talks of narrator; but in Molana's anecdotes, 5 dialogues occur in 4 couplets and the narrator just repeats the verb (said).

2- Query of caliph from Leili:

A) Dialogue structure in Attar anecdote

1- Dialogue between Aaron and Majnun which is about the beauty of Majnun (Mosibatname, couplets 2500-2504)

B) Structure of dialogue in Molana's anecdotes

1- Dialogue between Leili and Khalife in which Khalife calls into question the beauty of Leili (Masnavi, first book, couplets 407 and 408)

Aaron and Majnun are dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote and Khalife and Leili are the dialogue parts in Molana's anecdote. The clear difference in these two anecdotes is that



the Khalife talks with lover in Attar's anecdote, but in Molana's anecdote, the Khalife talks with loved. The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is questioning the beauty of Leili by Khalife (Aaron).

#### 3- Azrael looking at the man

The dialogue parts Attar's anecdote include: 1- Soleilman and the young man, 2- Suleiman and Migh, 3- Suleiman and Azrael. The dialogue parts in Molana's anecdote include: 1- Suleiman and the man, 2- Suleiman and wind, 3- Suleiman and Azrael, 4- God and Azrael, 5- Azrael with himself. The number of dialogues in anecdotes of Attar and Molana is 3 and 5, respectively. The topic in both anecdotes is fear of young (man) from seeing Azrael and end of his life.

#### 4- Merchant who went to India for trade

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include trapped parrot and the Wise in India and the Wise in India and parrots living in India. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are merchant and slave and the maid, merchant and trapped parrot, merchant and parrots which are freedom in India land, and merchant with himself. The topic of both anecdotes is captivity of parrot that imitates the behavior of free parrots and gets free.

#### 5- Old minstrel

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include old man and God, unknown man and Sheikh, and servant and Sheikh. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are minstrel and God, minstrel with himself, Hatef and Omar in dream, Omar with himself, Omar and the old man. The topic in both anecdotes is decrepit and feebleness of (old) minstrel, playing for God and demanding wage from God, and awareness of old (minstrel). The dialogue in Molana's anecdotes is longer than anecdotes of Attar. There is no self-talk in Attar's anecdote; however, it occurs 3 times in Molana's anecdotes.

#### 6- Khalife whose generosity is more than Hatam Tai

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include the man with himself, Ma'mun and the man, and beggar and Khalife. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are the Arabic man and his wife, the Arabic man and Naqiban, the Arabic man with himself. The topic in both anecdotes is generosity of Ma'mun (Khalife).

#### 7- Who wants help

The dialogue parts in both anecdotes are lover and loved. The dialogue in Molana's anecdote is longer than Attar's

anecdote. The topic in both anecdotes is the meeting of lover and loved.

#### 8- Comrade asks Jesus to revive the bone

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include the Jesus and the fool man, and Jesus and his companions. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Jesus and the fool man, Jesus and God, and Jesus and lion. The dialogue in Molana's anecdotes is longer than Attar's anecdotes.

#### 9- King finds his eagle in the home of old woman

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include King and the army. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are old woman and king, and king and eagle. The topic in both anecdotes is escaping of eagle and going to house of old woman. In Molana's anecdote, the eagle talks; but in Attar's anecdote, the eagle has no talking.

#### 10- Sheikh Ahmed Khazruye buys halva

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Sheikh Ahmad and God, and the anonymous person and creditors. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Sheikh and servant, servant and the child who sells halva, Sheikh and creditors, and the child who sells halva and Sheikh. The topic of dialogue is paying the loans of lenders. The dialogue in Molana's anecdotes is longer than dialogue in Attar's anecdotes.

#### 11- Friends come to hospital to question Zулnun

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Shibli and visitors, friends of Shibli and Shibli, Khalife's messenger and Shibli. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Zулnun's friends with each other, and Zулnun and his friends. Maulana has changed the Shibli character's name to Zулnun. In Attar's anecdotes, there is dialogue between Khalife's messenger and Shibli; but in Maulana anecdotes, the Khalife character is deleted and is not mentioned. The topic in both anecdotes is testing the friendship, friends of Shibli (Zулnun, and his insanity). The dialogue in Molana's anecdotes is longer than the dialogue in Attar's anecdotes.

#### 12- King says Sheikh that ask me something to give you

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include the king and tattered man. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are king and Sheikh. The story is about these two characters.

#### 13- Appearance of Loghman's grace and art

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include King and servant. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are



Khawaja and Loghman. The topic in both anecdotes is testing servant (Loghman) by King (Khawaja). In Attar's anecdotes, the statement is somewhat devoid of sense; but in Molana's anecdotes, Khwaja's great affection to Loghman is quite evident. In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue is much longer than the dialogue in Attar's anecdotes.

#### 14- Bayazid Bastami goes to Kaaba

The dialogue parts in both anecdotes are Bayezid and the (old) man. The topic in both anecdotes is Bayazid's travelling to Mecca. In Attar's anecdotes, there is no emotional relationship between two characters; but in Molana's anecdotes, there is emotional relationship between two characters.

#### 15- Dignity of Ibrahim Adham on beach

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Ibrahim Adham and unknown person, and Ibrahim Adham and fishes in the sea. The topic is abandoning the monarchy by Ibrahim and seeking its cause by unknown person. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Amir talking with himself, and Ibrahim and the fishes of sea. The topic is the same as Attar's anecdote. There is no self-talk in Attar's anecdotes, but it occurs once in Molana's anecdotes.

#### 16- Miracles of the Sheikh who was accused to stealing

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include owner of Dinar and the passengers. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are owner of Homian and the poor, poor Darvish and God, and the poor dervish and passengers. The topic in Attar's anecdotes is questing for wages of ship from the owner of Dinar; but in Molana's anecdotes, the topic is accusing the poor Darvish to stealing and reveal of Darvish's dignity.

#### 17- The lovers' error is better than aliens's requital

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Hassan Basari with himself, and God and Hassan Basari. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are God and Hassan Basari. The topic in both anecdotes is false pronunciation of words in Azan and prayer by Balal.

#### 18- Darvish isolated in the mountain

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Abu al-Khair and Sufis, Abu al-Khair and disciples, Shahnes and Abu al-Khair, Abu al-Khair and Amir, and Sheikh and wife. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Darwish and God, rider and Ayan, and Shahne and Darvish. The topic in both anecdotes is breaking the covenant and ingratitude of Abu al-Khair (Darwish). The number of

characters who are dialogue parts in Attar and Molana's anecdotes is 7 and 5, respectively.

#### 19- Bayazid and his avoidance

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Bayazid friends and Beyazid, and Bayazid with himself. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Bayazid with himself. In Attar's anecdotes, there is intimate relationship between Bayazid and his friends; but in Molana's anecdotes, there is no intimate relationship between Bayazid and his friends.

#### 20- Sheikh does not get upset for the death of his children

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include Fazil and Fazil's friends. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Sheikh and his family. The topic in both anecdotes is Sheikh does not get upset for death of his child and his family protest him. The character names are changed in Molana's anecdote which is derived from Attar's anecdote.

#### 21- Mosquito complains from wind to Suleiman

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote include mosquito and Suleiman. In Maulana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are mosquito and Suleiman, God and Suleiman, and Suleiman and wind. The topic in both anecdotes is mosquito complaining from wind to Suleiman.

### CONCLUSION:

According to this study, it can be said that in Masnavi, Molana considers the works of Attar in terms of structure and content. He has used dialogue as an important benchmark and element in arrangement of different components of his anecdotes. There is no doubt that Molana's Masnavi is a mystical and literary masterpiece; however, comparing it with Attar's works, especially in terms of dialogue type in common characters of these stories, there are seen consistencies which show the importance of Attar's works impact on creating great works after them.

### REFERENCES:

1. Akhlaghi, A. (1998). Structural analysis of Manteghotteir. Isfahan: Farda publication.
2. Estelami, M. (2008). Text and description of Molana's Masnavi. Volume 7. Tehran: Maharat publication.
3. Purna Madarian, T. (2009). In the shadow of sun, Persian poetry, and deconstruction in poetry of Molavi. Tehran: Sokhan Publication.



4. Pournamdarian, T. (2011). Meeting the Phoenix (Attar's poetry, mysticism, and ideas). Tehran: humanities research and studies publication.
5. Tavakoli, H.R (2010). The sea cues (Poetics story in Masnavi). Tehran: Morvarid Publication.
6. Zarrinkoob, A. (1999). The sound of wings of Phoenix (about the life and thought of Attar). Sokhan Publication.
7. Zarrinkoob, A. (2010). Sea in jars, interpreting Masnavi stories and analogies. Tehran: Maharat publication.
8. Zamani, K. (1993). Comprehensive description of Masnavi Manavi. Tehran: Etelaat publication.